



MINUTES

VI Meeting of the EUROSAT Task Force on the Audit of Funds Allocated to Disasters and Catastrophes

Date: May 15-16, 2014

Meeting Venue: Warsaw, the Republic of Poland

The Goals of the Meeting:

- Approval of the Report of the Task Force Secretariat on its activity during 2012-2014;
- Approval of the Draft Good Practice Recommendations for the Audit of Funds Allocated to Disasters and Catastrophes;
- Discussion of cooperation between the EUROSAT Task Force on the Audit of Funds Allocated to Disasters and Catastrophes and the EUROSAT Goal Team 3 “Knowledge Sharing”;
- Experience and knowledge sharing in the field of carrying out the performance audits concerning the funds allocated to disasters and catastrophes.

Representatives from **11 SAIs-members of the Task Force** attended the meeting: Azerbaijan, Bulgaria, Hungary, Kazakhstan, Moldova, Norway, Poland, Russian Federation, Slovak Republic, Ukraine and European Court of Auditors. The SAI of Czech Republic was invited as a guest and as a representative of the EUROSAT Goal Team 3 “Knowledge Sharing” of the EUROSAT Strategic Plan for 2011-2017.

The list of participants is attached.

Before the meeting, **the Seminar** on implementation and use of the new INTOSAI standards (ISSAIs 5500-5599) was held on May 15, 2014, according to the Work Plan of the EUROSAT Task Force on the Audit of Funds Allocated to Disasters and Catastrophes for 2012-2014.

Ms. Torielle Perreur-Lloyd, Project Manager of the European Court of Auditors, presented the process of making and approval of ISSAIs, their objectives and outputs.

Mr. Piotr Miklis, Director of the Regional Branch in Katowice, the Supreme Audit Office of Poland, presented the experience of implementation of INTOSAI standards and the ways for their further use. **Ms. Michaela Rosecka and Ms. Marcela Bargelova**, representatives of the EUROSAI Goal Team 3 (SAI of Czech Republic) described the main activities of the GT3, providing an overview of knowledge sharing, enhancement of coordination and cooperation among EUROSAI Working Groups.

Ms. Yulia Myronenko – Chief Specialist of the Nature Protection and Emergencies Audit Department of the Accounting Chamber of Ukraine – made a presentation on the role of the EUROSAI Task Force in development of methodology in the field of auditing funds allocated to disasters and catastrophes. She also presented the international auditing standards and external control of the public sector of economy.

The materials of the Seminar were distributed to all the participants.

Mr. Roman Maguta, Chairman of the Accounting Chamber of Ukraine and Mr. Krzysztof Kwiatkowski, President of Supreme Audit Office of Poland **opened the Meeting of the Task Force:**

Mr. Roman Maguta welcomed the participants of the VI EUROSAI Task Force meeting noticing that their efforts helped the Task Force to become a new EUROSAI body, and that the SAIs-members established close professional cooperation and achieved all the Task Force's goals.

He also noted that a deep understanding by SAIs of existing problems relating to readiness of each country and the world community as a whole to withstand disasters and catastrophes contributed to the effectiveness and efficiency of the Task Force. Achievements and plans for the future indicate a widening of the field of activities of the group and its areas of interest, and show the need to continue the work and, in fact, the need for transformation of the Task Force into the EUROSAI Working Group on the Audit of Funds Allocated to Disasters and Catastrophes.

Mr. Krzysztof Kwiatkowski – President of the Supreme Audit Office of Poland – welcomed all the participants of the VI EUROSAI Task Force meeting and noted that the issues relating to the provision of emergency preparedness does not lose its relevance and audits carried out in this area are some of the links in the joint efforts of governments, organizations, the international community, which aim at preventing possible catastrophes and eliminating their consequences.

Presentations and speeches

During the meeting, the plenary sessions on examples of audits in the sphere of prevention and consequences eliminations of catastrophes were held: the main challenges and findings, audit quality in the sphere of prevention and consequences elimination of disasters and catastrophes: their validity and reliability.

In her speech, **Ms. Natalia Trofim** – Head of the General Direction of the Court of Accounts of the Republic of Moldova – informed the participants about approaches and results of the national audit conducted by the Court on the use of public funds in the field of prevention and consequences elimination of catastrophes. In her presentation, Ms. Trofim presented the main results of the assessment of the status and functionality of the system of civil protection in the Republic of Moldova in case of emergencies and compliance use of public funds for the functioning and development of civil protection and disaster prevention.

Mr. Igor Enya – Chief of Inspection of the Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation – made a presentation on the topic “The main results of performance audits of budgetary funds allocated to prevention and consequences elimination of catastrophes”. In his presentation, he gave the examples of emergencies of natural and man-made disasters which the Russian Federation has faced in recent years, and also presented the results of control and expert-analytical activities carried out in the framework of the control over spending budget funds allocated to disasters and catastrophes.

Ms. Yulia Myronenko – Chief Specialist of the Nature Protection and Emergencies Audit Department of the Accounting Chamber of Ukraine – made a presentation on “The preliminary results of the International Coordinated Audit (Control) of Public Funds, Allocated to Prevention and Consequences Elimination of Disasters and Catastrophes”. The audit objectives was determined as assessment of legality and utilization efficiency of the public funds allocated to creation, functioning and development of the national system for prevention and response to natural and man-caused disasters and catastrophes. In addition, she described the audit stages, the audit issues, the main recommendations and conclusions, as well as the state of preparation of the Joint Report.

Mr. Denys Nikitin – Deputy Director of the Nature Protection and Emergencies Audit Department of the Accounting Chamber of Ukraine – presented “The Audit Results on Implementation of Recommendations of the International Coordinated Audit of Chernobyl Shelter Fund”. He focused on the results of the audit conducted by the Accounting Chamber of Ukraine in the first quarter of 2014, aimed at exercising control over the implementation of the recommendations of the International Coordinated Audit of the Chernobyl Shelter Fund. Among other things, he noted that the Accounting Chamber of Ukraine carries out such an audit every year and that the results indicate the advisability of continuing such monitoring until completion of works on the object “Shelter” and turning it into an ecologically safe system.

Ms. Detelina Hadjieva – Senior Auditor of the National Audit Office of Bulgaria – gave a presentation on “Combating Landslides, Erosion and Abrasion Processes at the Ministry of Regional Development”. She noted that the National Audit Office conducted the audit in 2012, and that the subject of the audit was the Ministry of Regional Development of Bulgaria, responsible for dealing with emergencies, in particular landslides. The audit objective was to determine the effectiveness of spending and the adequacy of measures taken to combat landslides, erosive and abrasive processes. Besides, she presented the main conclusions and recommendations of the audit.

Mr. Slawomir Sieranski – Deputy Director of the Department of the Supreme Audit Office of Poland – made a presentation on “Preparation of the civil protection system against natural disasters and contingencies”.

He noted that the main aim of the audit was to assess whether the civil protection system against natural disasters and contingencies in Poland functions coherently, and whether the entities responsible for the preparation and implementation of civil protection tasks executed their duties correctly. In addition, he presented the results of the audit and the recommendations made by the SAI of Poland.

May 16, 2014

Mr. Erlan Turlybekov – Member of the Accounts Committee over Execution of the Republican Budget of Kazakhstan – informed the participants about the state of the control measures in the field of prevention and consequences elimination of catastrophes undertaken by the Accounts Committee, as well as measures taken by the results of such inspections.

Mr. Igor Enya – Chief of Inspection of the Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation – made a presentation on the topic “The Practice of the follow-up control made by the Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation over the budget funds allocated to prevention, firefighting and elimination of consequences of natural fires”. He noted that the Accounts Chamber conducts monitoring activities regarding timeliness of allocation of financial resources and arranging procedures for replenishment of reserves, as well as the follow-up aimed at identifying target and effective use of budget funds during creation and development of warning, response and disaster management system. He said that these activities are carried out within the framework of financial, compliance, performance and comprehensive audits.

Ms. Yulia Myronenko – Chief Specialist of the Nature Protection and Emergencies Audit Department of the Accounting Chamber of Ukraine – made a presentation on “The Results of the Audit of Funds Allocated to Prevention and Consequences Elimination of Wildfires in Ukraine”. She noted that the Accounting Chamber of Ukraine completed the Audit of Funds Allocated to Prevention and Consequences Elimination of Wildfires in September 2013. This audit was carried out in accordance with the Work Plan of the EUROSAI Task Force on the Audit of Funds Allocated to Disasters and Catastrophes for 2012-2014.

The audit objective was to determine the actual state of the state budget funds, allocated to prevention and consequences elimination of wildfires in natural ecosystems, in terms of economy, efficiency and effectiveness. Ms. Myronenko presented the findings as well as key recommendations of the audit.

Mr. Przemyslaw Witek – Senior Expert on the State Audit of the Supreme Audit Office of Poland – presented “The Audit of Public Funds Allocated to Prevention and Consequences Elimination of Disasters and Catastrophes”. He noted that the audit was carried out in the framework of the international project from 2009 to 2012 and covered 23 central authorities of the Republic of Poland. The audit objective was to evaluate the state operations in the field of flood prevention and mitigation of natural disasters. The participants of the meeting were informed about the major conclusions and recommendations, which were sent to the authorities responsible for combating emergencies.

Mr. Denys Nikitin – Deputy Director of the Nature Protection and Emergencies Audit Department of the Accounting Chamber of Ukraine – made a presentation on the topic “The Examples of the Use of Tools Google Earth During the Audits”. He shared with the audience the experience of using Google Earth by the Accounting Chamber of Ukraine through the example of the Audit of the Use of State Budget Funds Allocated to the Conservation of the Natural Reserve Fund in the National Nature Reserves.

Also during the meeting, the Final Draft Good Practice Recommendations for the Audit of Funds Allocated to Disasters and Catastrophes was presented for approval by the participants.

Mr. Hennadiy Shakh – Director of the Standards, Analytics and Institutional Development Department of the Accounting Chamber of Ukraine – presented “**The Draft Good Practice Recommendations for the Audit of Funds Allocated to Disasters and Catastrophes**”. He commented on the background of this document and briefly described the way of its preparation as a recommendation to the latest edition.

The basis of the Recommendations is generalized results of a survey, conducted by the EUROSAI Task Force on the Audit of Funds Allocated to Disasters and Catastrophes among the Task Force members, and the database on the audits on natural and man-caused disasters and catastrophes in Europe, used materials and presentations from speakers at the meetings, analyzed and summarized documents on disasters and catastrophes.

The following materials were selected for the examples of the Good Practice Recommendations:

- reports of the National Audit Office of Sweden on the results of the audit “The Government’s crisis management and management of society’s preparedness for serious emergencies”;
- reports of the National Audit Office of Bulgaria on the results of the audit of the Project “Protection of the population and risk prevention regarding landslides in Rodopy municipality”;
- reports of the Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation on the results of the Control of the targeted and efficient use of the federal budget, allocated to the implementation of the Federal Task Program “Overcoming the consequences of radiation accidents until 2010”.

After the discussion, the participants took a decision to approve the Recommendations and submit the document for approval at IX EUROSAI Congress.

Ms. Aleksandra Kunderevych – Chief Specialist of the International Cooperation Department of the Accounting Chamber of Ukraine, a representative of the Task Force Secretariat – presented **the Report on the activities of the EUROSAI Task Force on the Audit of Funds Allocated to Disasters and Catastrophes for 2012 - 2014.**

She presented the achievements of the Task Force for the reporting period, namely:

- 9 SAIs completed their national audits in the framework of the International Coordinated Audit of the Budget Funds Allocated to Prevention and Consequences Elimination of Disasters and Catastrophes;
- The Accounting Chamber of Ukraine carried out the audit on implementation of the recommendations issued for the International Coordinated Audit of the Chernobyl Shelter Fund;

- In October 2013, in Prague, the Czech Republic, the SAIs of Bulgaria, Russia and Ukraine signed a Memorandum on conducting the International Coordinated Audit of Funds Allocated to Prevention and Elimination of Wildfires. The SAIs of Russia and Ukraine have already completed their national audits and the SAI of Bulgaria is carrying out it. The next meeting of the participants of the international audit will be held October 13-15, 2014, in Sofia, Bulgaria, during which the participants will discuss preparation of the Joint Report;
- In the framework of the Strategic goal 2: Methodology Development and Capacity Building, the Accounting Chamber of Ukraine has prepared the Third Draft Good Practice Recommendations on the Audit of Funds Allocated to Disasters and Catastrophes;
- The web portal of the Task Force has obtained a new section “Knowledge base on prevention and consequences elimination of disasters”, which contains terminology on disaster risk reduction as well as Hyogo Framework for Action 2005-2015;
- It is planned to start preparation of the Report of the Task Force activity for 2012-2014 and its future functioning during the next period to be presented at the next EUROSAI Congress.

After the discussion, the participants took a decision to approve the Report of the Secretariat on the Task Force’s activity.

Presentation of the Work Plan for 2015-2017.

Ms. Alexandra Kunderevych – Chief Specialist of the International Cooperation Department of the Accounting Chamber of Ukraine – presented a Draft Work Plan of the future EUROSAI Working Group for 2015-2017. In her speech, she noted that the Work Plan is based on the EUROSAI Strategic Plan for 2011-2017 and defines the mission, the main objectives and activities of the EUROSAI Working Group on the Audit of Funds Allocated to Disasters and Catastrophes for the period between IX and X EUROSAI Congresses. The mission of the EUROSAI Working Group is to coordinate and consolidate efforts of the European SAIs to help their governments in development of effective and efficient instruments for prevention and consequences elimination of disasters and catastrophes. Besides, she identified the following Strategic Goals of the Working Group: 1) Capacity building; 2) Professional development; 3) Knowledge sharing; 4) Extension of contacts.

After the discussion, the participants took a decision to approve the Draft Work Plan of the EUROSAI Working Group for 2015-2017.

Mrs. Mariya Shulezhko – Chief Controller-Director of the of the Nature Protection and Emergencies Audit Department of the Accounting Chamber of Ukraine – presented the Draft Resolution of the EUROSAI Congress on transformation of the Task Force into the EUROSAI Working Group on the Audit of Funds Allocated to Disasters and Catastrophes. She pointed out that the Accounting Chamber of Ukraine, after consultation with the Task Force members, took an initiative and addressed the EUROSAI Governing Board with the proposition on transformation of the Task Force into the EUROSAI Working Group. The Task Force Secretariat has prepared the Draft Resolution on transformation of the Task Force into the Working Group for approval at IX EUROSAI Congress.

After the discussion, the participants took a decision to approve the Draft Resolution of the EUROSAI Congress on transformation of the Task Force into the Working Group.

Closing speeches

Mr. Roman Maguta – the Chairman of the Accounting Chamber of Ukraine – thanked the SAI of the Republic of Poland for the organization and hosting the meeting on a high professional level and expressed the collective opinion about the importance of continuing fruitful cooperation in the future. He mentioned once again the progress achieved by the Task Force and noted that all the formulated tasks had been performed.

Mr. Wojciech Kutyla – the Vice-President of the Supreme Audit Office of Poland – thanked everyone for attending the meeting, as well as for the fruitful work within the EUROSAI Task Force. He expressed appreciation to the Accounting Chamber of Ukraine and personally to Mr. Maguta for coordinating the Task Force's activity and professional preparation and organization of the meeting. He noticed the relevance of the topic and the importance of continuation of exchange of experiences in the field of prevention and

consequences elimination of disasters and catastrophes. He noted that the work of the Task Force and such forums are an effective tool in combating natural and man-caused disasters and catastrophes.

Meetings of the participants of the international coordinated audits

May 15, 2014, within the framework of the Task Force meeting, the following meetings of the participants of the international coordinated audits take place:

- the first meeting of the participants of the International Coordinated Audit of Funds Allocated to Prevention and Elimination of Wildfires. During the meeting the participants (the SAIs of Bulgaria, Russia and Ukraine) defined the timeframes of joint activities, discussed the structure and necessary documents for the Joint Report, signing of which is scheduled for the first half of 2015.
- the third meeting of the participants of the International Coordinated Audit of the Budget Funds Allocated to Prevention and Consequences Elimination of Disasters and Catastrophes. The participants of the audit are the SAIs of Azerbaijan, Belarus, Hungary, Italy, Kazakhstan, Moldova, Poland, Russia and Ukraine. During the meeting the participants approved the preamble, common findings and recommendations of the international coordinated audit as well as took the decisions to agree upon the Draft Joint Report before June 2014 and sign Joint Report at IX EUROSAI Congress (June 16-19, 2014, The Hague, the Netherlands).

The participants of the VI Meeting of the EUROSAI Task Force on the Audit of Funds Allocated to Disasters and Catastrophes:

From the Chamber of Accounts of the Republic of Azerbaijan:

Mr. Azim Abasov – Head of the Department

Mr. Nazim Hasanov – Auditor

From the National Audit Office of Bulgaria:

Ms. Detelina Hadjieva – Senior Auditor

Ms. Ventsislava Tomova – Senior Auditor

From the State Audit Office of Hungary:

Mr. Istvan Szilas – Auditor Counsellor

Mr. Janos Szatmari – Auditor Counsellor

Accounts Committee over Execution of the Republican Budget of Kazakhstan:

Mr. Erlan Turlybekov – Member of the Accounts Committee

The Court of Accounts of the Republic of Moldova:

Ms. Natalia Trofim – Head of the General Direction I

From the Office of the Auditor General of Norway:

Ms. Anne Fikkan – Deputy Director General

From the Supreme Audit Office of Poland:

Mr. Piotr Miklis – Director of the Regional Branch in Katowice

Mr. Przemyslaw Witek – Senior Expert on the State Audit

From the Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation:

Mr. Igor Enya – Chief of Inspection

Mr. Valery Kryuchkov – Advisor

From the Supreme Audit Office of the Slovak Republic:

Mr. Igor Blasko – Auditor

From the Accounting Chamber of Ukraine:

Mr. Roman Maguta – Chairman

Mrs. Mariya Shulezhko – Chief Controller – Director of the Agricultural Industry, Nature Protection and Emergencies Audit Department

Mr. Denys Nikitin – Deputy Director of the Department

Mr. Hennadiy Shakh – Director of the Standards, Analytics and Institutional Development Department

Mr. Mykhailo Tolstanov – Director of the International Cooperation Department

Ms. Yulia Myronenko – Chief specialist of the Nature Protection and Emergencies Audit Department

Ms. Oleksandra Kunderevych – Chief Specialist of the International Cooperation Department

From the EUROSAI Goal Team 3 “Knowledge Sharing” (Supreme Audit Office of the Czech Republic):

Ms. Michaela Rosecka – Chair of GT3

Ms. Marcela Bargelova – Auditor