



## **MINUTES**

### **V Meeting of the EUROSAT Task Force on the Audit of Funds allocated to Disasters and Catastrophes**

**Date:** March 26-27, 2013

**Meeting Venue:** Sofia, Republic of Bulgaria

The EUROSAT Task Force on the Audit of Funds allocated to Disasters and Catastrophes numbers 13 members: SAIs of Azerbaijan, Armenia, Belarus, Belgium, Bulgaria, Hungary, Kazakhstan, Lithuania, Moldova, Poland, Russian Federation, Ukraine, as a Chair, and the European Court of Auditors and. The SAIs of Norway, the Slovak Republic and Italy participate in the Task Force's activities as the observers.

The EUROSAT Task Force's on the Audit of Funds Allocated to Disasters and Catastrophes activities are realizing on the Resolution of the VIIIth EUROSAT Congress accordingly to the Work Plan of the Task Force for 2012-2014 approved at IV Meeting in Wrocław, Republic of Poland.

V Meeting was held in Sofia, Republic of Bulgaria, on March 26-27, 2013.

#### **The Goals of the Meeting:**

- Approval of the Report of the Task Force Secretariat on its activity during 2012;
- Revision of the Work Plan of the EUROSAT Task Force on the Audit of Funds Allocated to Disasters and Catastrophes for 2012-2014 and its updating;
- Discussion of the second draft good practice recommendations for the audit of funds allocated to disasters and catastrophes;
- Discussion of cooperation between the EUROSAT Task Force on the Audit of Funds Allocated to Disasters and Catastrophes and EUROSAT Goal Team 3 "Knowledge Sharing";
- Experience and knowledge sharing in the field of carrying out the performance audits concerning the funds allocated to disasters and catastrophes.

24 representatives of 9 SAIs attended the Meeting: Bulgaria, Hungary, Kazakhstan, Moldova, Norway, Poland, Russian Federation, Slovak Republic and Ukraine. The

SAI of Czech Republic was invited as a guest and as representative of the EUROSAI Goal Team 3 “Knowledge Sharing” of the EUROSAI Strategic Plan for 2011-2017. The authorities of Bulgaria and the Representation of the European Commission in Bulgaria also took part in the meeting.

Before the meeting, **the Seminar** on experience of auditing in the field of control over the public funds expenditure allocated to prevention and consequences elimination of the catastrophes (results, criteria, sources of audit information, methods of its obtaining) was held on March 26, 2013, according to the Work Plan of the EUROSAI Task Force on the Audit of Funds Allocated to Disasters and Catastrophes for 2012-2014. During the seminar the participants submitted the presentations on next topics: Wildfires: causes and ways to prevent, Water pollution as one of main causes of environmental catastrophes.

Having finished the seminar the material was delivered to the participants.

Prof. Valeriy Dimitrov, President of the National Audit Office of Bulgaria, and Mr. Aleksandr Yaremenko, Deputy Chairman of the Accounting Chamber of Ukraine, **opened the Meeting**.

**Prof. Valeriy Dimitrov, President of the National Audit Office of Bulgaria**, welcomed the participants of the Vth Meeting and noticed that the issues on ensuring the disaster preparedness did not lose their importance and audits carried out in the mentioned field were chain links of the joint efforts of governments, organizations aimed at prevention of eventual catastrophes and their consequences elimination.

**Mr. Aleksandr Yaremenko, Deputy Chairman of the Accounting Chamber of Ukraine**, noted that holding meetings in the different countries gave the opportunity to experience exchange and obtain new knowledge on carrying out audits in the field of prevention and consequences elimination of disasters. Also Mr. Yaremenko marked that effective and fruitful collaboration between members of the Task Force and stakeholders was established. He emphasized that such collaboration as carrying out the joint audits, participation in the annual meetings, development of the recommendations of the best practice, information and experience sharing on the audits of funds allocated to disasters and catastrophes was useful not only for members of the Task Force but also for stakeholders.

**Mrs. Zinaida Zlatanova**, Head of the Representation of the European Commission of Bulgaria, focused upon the increasing number of world threatening and challenges which were the causes of appearance of natural and man-caused catastrophes. Namely: climate change, planet population explosion, intense urbanization and terrorism threat. Also she noted the activity of the European Community in improving the mechanisms of prevention and consequences elimination of natural and man-caused catastrophes.

## Presentations and speeches

### **Report of the EUROSAI Task Force on the Audit of Funds Allocated to Disasters and Catastrophes on the activity during 2012**

The report was presented by **Mrs. Mariya Shulezhko** – Chief Controller and Director of the Agricultural Industry, Nature Protection and Emergencies Audit Department of the Accounting Chamber of Ukraine.

She dwelt on the decisions which had been approved on the previous meeting of the Task Force and reminded of having approved the Work Plan for the 3 years period. She paid attention to the EUROSAI Task Force Mission which was to coordinate and consolidate the efforts of European SAIs towards increasing their awareness of the disasters and catastrophes and to help governments develop the effective and efficient instruments of disasters and catastrophes prevention and consequences elimination.

**She also informed that during the year of 2012 the participants of the Task Force:**

- the national audits were finished within the international coordinated audit of funds allocated to prevention and consequences elimination of disasters and catastrophes in which 8 SAIs took part;
- the Accounting Chamber had carried out a follow-up audit of recommendations implementation of the International Co-ordinated Audit of the Chernobyl Shelter Fund;
- planned to start preparation for the carrying out the international coordinated audit of funds allocated to prevention and wildfire elimination with **possible signing of common position of its realization during next meeting of the EUROSAI WGEA in October in Prague, Czech Republic;**
- within the Strategic goal 2: Methodology Development and Capacity Building the Third Draft Recommendations of the good practices on the Audit of Funds Allocated to Disasters and Catastrophes was prepared;
- there was new section “Knowledge base on the prevention and consequences elimination of disasters ”on the web-site of the Task Force which contained Terminology on Disaster Risk Reduction and Hyogo Framework for Action 2005-2015;
- development of the Report of the Task Force activity for 2012-2014 and its future functioning during next period what was indented to present at next INTOSAI Congress.

**During discussions the decision** to approve the report was taken.

### **Amendments to the work plan of the EUROSAI Task Force on the Audit of Funds Allocated to Disasters and Catastrophes.**

Suggestions were presented by **Mrs. Mariya Shulezhko**, the Accounting Chamber of Ukraine:

- to prolong the timing of carrying out the international coordinated audit of the funds allocated to prevention and consequences elimination of disasters and catastrophes to 2014 due to the necessity to compose of the joint report and to present the audit results at the INTOSAI Congress in 2014 (article 1.1. of the Work Plan of the Task Force).
- to extend the frames of the international coordinated audit of the execution the Convention on Cooperation for the Protection and Sustainable Use of the River Danube and examine the basins of the Don and Dnieper Rivers.
- to change the title of the abovementioned audit and name it as “Carrying out the international coordinated audit of the Black Sea Catchment Protection against Pollution” and to divide it into three stages:
  1. Convention on Cooperation for the Protection and Sustainable Use of the River Danube;
  2. Audit of the Don River basin;
  3. Audit of the Dnieper River basin (article 1.2.).
    - to exclude the articles 1.3. and 1.4. concerning the audits which did not find their confirmation: international coordinated audits of creation of safe conditions for navigation in the basins of the Black and Azov Seas and implementation of state policy in the sphere of protection and safety of work in the coal-mining industry.
    - to amend the article 1.6. - carrying out a follow-up audit of recommendations implementation of the International Coordinated Audit of the Chernobyl Shelter Fund, which intended to carry out in the first quarter of the year 2012; actually the follow-up audit finished and its results would be presented shortly, it was suggested to extend timing to years 2012-2013.

**During discussions the decision** to amend the Work Plan of the Task Force for 2012-2014 was taken. The amendments to the Work Plan are attached.

**Mrs. Shulezhko** submitted the presentation on behalf of the Chairman of the INTOSAI Working Group on Accountability for and Disaster-related Aid (AADA) who couldn't attend the Task Force meeting. The main goals of the activity of the Working Group were presented, also the participants were informed of the Seventh Meeting of the Working Group, approval of 5 INTOSAI Standards and examination of the Final Draft INTOSAI GOV and the Final Report of the Working Group on Accountability for and Disaster-related Aid.

**Ms. Galina Balusheva**, Chief expert, Water Management Directorate, Ministry of Environment and Water, Bulgaria, presented the legislative fundamentals in the field of water pollution. It was also given an accurate account of the competent authorities' activity in that field and the procedure of carrying out the performance audits.

**Mrs. Regina Charyparova**, Director of Audit Department and **Mrs. Marcela Bargelova**, Auditor, the representatives of the EUROSAI Goal Team 3 (SAI of

Czech Republic) submitted presentation of the main objectives of the Goal Team's 3 activities, giving the review of the programme of information sharing between the EUROSAI members and improvement of coordination between the Working Groups.

### **March 27, 2013**

**Ms. Albena Bobeva**, Senior Expert, International Relations Department, Executive Forest Agency, Ministry of Agriculture and Food, Bulgaria, gave a presentation on the topic **“The Impact of Forests Ecosystems on Water Quantity and Quality”**. The problems of the water quantity and quality on the Bulgarian territory were touched upon in the presentation, as well as the reasons of water pollution and impact of forests conditions on water quality.

**Mr. Hennadiy Shakh**, Director of Standards, Analytics and Institutional Development Department of the Accounting Chamber of Ukraine, presented **“Draft good practice recommendations for the audit of funds allocated to disasters and catastrophes”**. He commented on the history of development of the document and briefly described its way to the Recommendations till the last draft. The fundamentals of the Recommendations were summarized results of survey conducted by the Secretariat among the Task Force members and database on the audits on natural and man-caused disasters and catastrophes in Europe, the documents and presentations of the reporters submitted at the meetings were used, the documents concerning disasters and catastrophes were analyzed and summarized.

For examples of good practice were selected:

- reports of the National Audit Office of Sweden on the results of the audit on “The Government's crisis management and management of society's preparedness for serious emergencies”;
- reports of the Bulgarian National Audit Office on the results of the audit on Project “Protection of the population and risk prevention regarding landslides in Rodopy municipality”;
- reports of the Accounts Chamber of Russian Federation on the results of the audit on Control of the targeted and efficient use of the federal budget, allocated to the implementation of the Federal Task Program “Overcoming the consequences of radiation accidents until 2010”.

The examples of those audits supplied the subsections: national and regional levels of the part 3.1. audit on disaster prevention and securing preparedness and part 3.3. audit of the rehabilitation and reconstruction phase.

**During the discussion the decision to create a column** “Knowledge base on the prevention and consequences elimination of disasters” which contained the documents used during the development of the recommendations in Russian and English languages was taken.

**Mrs. Shulezhko** gave a report on implementation of Recommendations of international coordinated audit on Chernobyl Shelter Fund.

The audit object was to assess the transformation of the Shelter entity into the ecological safe system. The Donors Assembly of Chernobyl Shelter Fund, the European Bank for Reconstruction and Development, government of Ukraine, governments of the Fund investors' countries during 2011-2012 continued implementing the recommendations and realized them in such scopes which ensured to achieve the progress to solve the key problems concerning the execution of taking actions Plan on the Shelter entity.

The recommendations of the international coordinated audit were mainly implemented. Particularly:

- governments of the investors' countries of the Chernobyl Shelter Fund intensified the Fund management;
- the Donors Assembly had been receiving the report of the European Bank for Reconstruction and Development on the progress of the works on the project twice a year;
- the phased delegation of powers of the managing group of Action Plan to the Ukrainian personnel;
- the Ukrainian government ensured the stability and facility of the legislative-organizational environment of the realizing Action Plan.

The analysis of realizing of Action Plan on the Shelter entity showed the progress in implementing the project works. The first phase of the plan for 1998-2000 implemented, the engineering developments finished. As for the second phase of Plan of taking actions, which began in the year 2001 and concerned the project and objects building had being realizing such projects:

- water construction designing of new safe confinement;
- construction of new ventiduct and concomitant systems of the second stage of the Chernobyl nuclear power plant;
- demounting design;
- field supervision over the demounting works;
- ventiduct demounting of the second stage of the Chernobyl nuclear power plant;
- equipment of external lightning immunity, system of physical security and control over access to the Shelter entity.

The main problems were outlined:

- construction of new safe confinement was retarded in a year at that the total period of construction delay constituted 10 years;
- building and assembly jobs on objects of waste of poisonous fuel Hayad-2 were not proceeded, the total period of project realization delay constituted 12 years;
- implementation of the factory of processing of liquid radioactive wastes postponed to 3 years starting from period foreseen at the beginning of its construction and trailed 13 years;

- implementation of the industrial complex of processing solid radioactive wastes was postponed and the period was not determined. The total period of delay of project implementation constituted more than 8 years.

### **Closing speeches**

**Prof. Valeriy Dimitrov**, President of the National Audit Office of Bulgaria, thanked all the participants for the active work, tendered thanks to Mrs. Zinaida Zlatanova, Head of the Representation of the European Commission of Bulgaria, Mrs. Regina Charyparova and Mrs. Marcela Bargelova, the representatives of the EUROSAI Goal Team 3 for finding the opportunity to attend the Meeting. The Meeting was fruitful and all the results were achieved.

**Mr. Aleksandr Yaremenko**, Deputy Chairman of the Accounting Chamber of Ukraine, thanked Prof. Valeriy Dimitrov and SAI of Bulgaria for having hold the meeting at high professional level and gave common view on consecutive fruitful collaboration. He accented achieved results and marked that all the objectives were fulfilled.